



Minutes for 7 March 2019

The regular monthly meeting of the Gualala Municipal Advisory Council (GMAC) was held on Thursday, 7 March 2019 at the Gualala Community Center in downtown Gualala. Council Members present were: Lloyd Chasey, Melissa Finley, Charles Ivor, and Robert Juengling. Administrative Secretary Mary Mobert and four members of the public were also present (see sign-in sheet and speaker's cards). **Council Chair Juengling** convened the meeting at 18:40 after the Sheriff's Forum adjourned.

1. **Sheriff Forum:** Mendocino County Sheriff Tom Allman, Undersheriff Mat Kendel, Sheriff's Coast Commander, Lieutenant Greg Stefani, Sheriff's Officer Dave Harston, California Highway Patrol (CHP) Officer Hinds, and ten members of the public were in attendance. The meeting was convened at 18:06. Graffiti in Point Arena, flooding in the County caused by the recent heavy rains, a Mental Health facility update, and new rocking chairs for pregnant inmates were topics raised. The meeting adjourned 18:37.
2. **Introductions and Announcements:** Council Members introduced themselves. **Council Chair Juengling** announced Council Member Watts will no longer be able to fulfill his obligations and had submitted his resignation. Three Regular Member's and one Alternate Member seats now need to be filled. **Council Chair Juengling** will send a card thanking Council Member Watts thanking him for his service and an article will be prepared for the ICO asking Gualala residents to consider serving on the Council.
3. **Consent Agenda:**
 - a. **Minutes: 6 December 2018 and 7 February 2019:**
 - i) It was moved by Council Member Chasey, seconded by Council Member Ivor, and unanimously carried that the 6 December 2018 Minutes be approved as presented.
 - ii) It was agreed the 7 February Minutes be tabled until 4 April.
 - b. **Correspondence; All were recognized as received:**
 - i. Annual Mendocino Community Network (MCN) Internet-provider's statement for \$179.40
 - ii. P.O. Box Rent Invoice for 2019 for \$42 & Warning of Cancellation Notice
 - iii. MCN Invoice for \$179.40
 - iv. CalFire Timber Harvest Plan (THP) Library Online Address Change
 - v. CalFire THP 1-15-042 SON (Dogwood) Revised Plan
 - vi. CalFire THP Notifications Renewal Form
 - vii. CDP #2017-0047 (Koogle); Location: 29151 Walker Gulch Road; APN 142-010-30
4. **Approval of Agenda:**

It was moved by Council Member Ivor, seconded by Council Member Chasey, and unanimously carried that the Agenda be approved as presented.
5. **Public Input on Non-agenda Items:**

Jim Koogle, Gualala-area resident, gave a history of his upcoming CDP #2017-0047, located at 29151 Walker Gulch Road; APN 142-010-30. Council Members Chasey and Ivor will walk the property this month and lead the discussion 4 April (see item 18 below).
6. **Report: Mendocino County Law/Code Enforcement:**

See recording of the Sheriff's Forum on GMAC's website:
www.gualalamac.org

7. **CDPU_2018-0020 (Point Arena Elementary School & AT&T)**; Location: 39290 Old Stage Road, APN 145-091-22; Coastal Development Use Permit to construct a new telecommunications facility within a 2,025 sq. ft. lease area. The site is proposed to consist of a 123 ft. tall lattice type tower with 12 panel antennae, 24 radio units, surge suppressors along with various appurtenant equipment, a diesel electricity generator with a 54 gallon diesel fuel tank for backup power needs, and ground mounted equipment cabinets within the fenced-in lease area to facilitate the operations of the cell tower. Access to the lease area is to be via an existing asphalt driveway accessed from Old Stage Road. Council Members Finley and Juengling walked and saw the property.

Jarid Karsley and Donna Davis of AT&T External Affairs Department explained the project and setbacks. The tower sits at an elevation of 722 feet, is hidden by trees from all angles, and does not block the view of coast. *Epic, First Net, AT&T, Cap2*, and other providers will furnish internet service. It will not transmit into Gualala proper; the proposed tower in Gualala will provide the town with cell service and be independent from this one. It will not preclude a school being built on the property; it will be grandfathered by the time a school is built. Eventually, AT&T will have eleven towers throughout Mendocino County. A map of the coverage area was referenced (see CDP archives and 6 December 2018 Minutes).

Council Member Chasey noted the Federal government issued grants to companies for erecting towers and providing service to underserved, high priority communities like Gualala and he saw the tower as consistent with Federal rules. **Ms. Davis** stated AT&T has taken advantage of this grant. The company will not install 5G internet service in this area because there are not enough people to make it profitable. **Mr. Karsley** noted that, with as many homes being located on large parcels of land as there were in the area, fiberoptic connections to those homes was also too monetarily prohibitive for the company.

Council Member Finley cited several studies regarding the radiofrequency electromagnetic radiation emissions of cell towers. The studies utilized by the FCC and on which they based their regulations, as well as those regulations, are way out of date. Cell towers emit radiation all day, every day throughout the year. She felt they were a danger and, once built, a precedent was set. Fighting the proliferation is harder when one is already in place. Since most of the neighbors don't want the tower, she didn't want to make a decision without hearing their input.

Navid Farah, resident of Manchester, asked if the tower was carcinogenic to residents in the area. He can feel the radiation emitted by the tower in Manchester located 3.74 miles from his home and cited multiple studies on their dangers. **Mr. Karsley** said no, the tower's emissions will register at 3% of the total allowed by FCC regulation's limits.

Council Member Chasey noted Mendocino County has accepted the FCC regulations on cell- and internet-providing towers. The project fits the County's plan of access for all County residents and benefits community.

Council Member Finley asked about grading onsite noting the CDP's inconsistency that states in one section there would be no grading and in another the road will be graded. In a different part, the CDP states AT&T workers will visit the site once a month; further on, it says mechanical equipment and fuel storage will be inspected daily. She requested the CDP be amended to include road grading and how many cubic feet were involved, as well as correct statements about workers visit's making them clearer.

Council Chair Juengling wanted to hear from the school and/or local residents but those factions were

not present to express their viewpoint. He noted this tower doesn't serve the downtown population and businesses. The North Gualala Water Company (NGWC) was rumored to be building a reservoir near the tower's site. He wondered about the effects of a cell tower and the broadcast radiation on drinking water. He also noted AT&T was proposing to build on the first ridge in Irish Beach. **Mr. Karsley** said it will not connect to this one in Gualala.

Mr. Karsley noted the County is obligated to announce its decision within 90 days of issuing a CDP. If the citizens unanimously request the project be denied, the company would consider their reasons for denial. If it was for, example, blocking ocean views or being an eyesore to the community, the project could be rethought. If it was for health reasons, it would be built anyway since AT&T has not found scientific evidence to confirm that hypothesis.

It was moved by Council Member Chasey, seconded by Council Member Ivor, and unanimously carried that, since the Council didn't have enough information to make a beneficial decision, to table the issue, inform the County that GMAC intends to hold a Forum on 4 April on the issue to hear the opinions of neighbors and other Gualala residents in the tower's immediate vicinity, and to announce the Forum in the ICO. Council Member Finley will write the County.

8. Status of the Gualala Water Moratorium (Ivor & Juengling)

Council Chair Juengling reported a petition had been submitted to the *State Water Resources Control Board* by the North Gualala Water Company (NGWC) requesting an extension and reduction of the current terms of NGWC's water diversion permit for 20 years. NGWC's permit is for finding new water sources. The State ask NGWC to find other water sources than the Gualala River; the company is considering building a reservoir. He feels bypass regulations should be retained and the reservoir built.

Council Member Ivor added that the science behind NGWC's present system and bypass are antiquated at best. Almost nothing has been accomplished over the last 20 years. Local hydrologists don't recommend the 20 year extension, feel present laws should be enforced, and the NGWC be required to build a reservoir. If built, the state could drop the water moratorium and extend NGWC's serve area.

9. Council Matters:

a. Discussion: Gualala Community Action Plan (Streetscape Planning)

Council Chair Juengling reported that Frank Demling, CalTrans' Gualala Streetscaping Project Manager, Cari Williams, Caltrans' Gualala Streetscaping Project Environmental Planner and Coördinator and additional staff from CalTrans will be attending the 4 April meeting to give an update on the project. Nephele Barrett, the new Executive Director of the Mendocino Council of Governments (MCOG) and its Board of directors will holding their monthly meeting 1 April on the Couth Coast. A walking tour of the downtown Gualala area is planned fo5r the afternoon.

Council Member Chasey stated walkways and landscaping need to be designed and parking issues solved; this will take years.

b. Discussion: Gualala Parking Issues:

Council Member Finley reported the latest Parking Committee Meeting was held Monday, 4 March. She, Steve May, and John Bower attended. Mr. Bower wants a guaranteed approval of the retaining wall behind the Surf Market by the California Coastal Commission and that he will not be fined if petroleum pollutants are found during the wall construction before he agrees to cooperate on the Streetscaping Project.

Council Member Chasey felt a compromise could be reached by using CalTrans' alternative sidewalk plan with on-street parking. The Continuous Sidewalk Plan and Alternate Traffic Flow and Parking diagram of the Surf Market complex was viewed and discussed (see attached). A

proposal of razing the present buildings, erecting others along the boundary lines, and installing a parking lot with a view of the river mouth and ocean was also discussed.

c. Various CalTrans and; County Issues:

i. Future Mill Bend Coalition Speaker:

Council Member Ivor stated the properties are still in escrow with unnamed non-profits. **Council Member Chasey** noted several non-profits are exploring the idea of opening it to public use and are conducting soil tests for potential funders who can't support a project found to have pollutants and/or toxins on site.

ii. Invite Planning and Building Department Representative to Speak: None

iii. CalTrans 2020 Highway One Repaving Project:

Council Chair Juengling reported CalTrans is planning to repave Highway One from the Gualala Bridge to beyond Point Arena in 2020. He felt repaving the portion that included the Gualala Streetscaping Project should be excluded from this project since it would be done during the streetscaping commencing a year or two after this project was finished.

10. Chairman Juengling's Report:

Chairman Juengling noted form 700 must be completed and sent to the County by 1 April.

11. Vice-Chairman Ivor's Report:

Vice Chairman Ivor reported the Friends of the Gualala River (FoGR) held a Forum Tuesday, 26 February on the future of the river that was the largest meeting it has ever held. Jeannie Jackson presented a slide show, and information and discussion on the "Dogwood" and other THPs took place. Higher levels of scrutiny are needed during the permit process because of the unprecedented demand to log in the flood plain, and to protect critical habitat animals need for refuge and spawning. CalFire has to acknowledge what the flood plain is, where it lies, and address sensitive habitat issues.

Plants and Animals that live in the flood plain will hold sediment and habitat if encouraged to do it. This will allow the river to clean itself and create more habitat for future generations. Because of the cumulative effect of 100 years of unsupervised logging—and the fact that *Gualala Timber* has plans to apply for more THPs in the flood plain because that's where the money is—, CalFire should demand a Cumulative Impact Report on all CDPs. FoGR will take this to CalFire for approval.

Companies have rejected money from non-profits equaling the amount that could be made from logging the river banks and flood plains of their only trees of size that are more fire resistant. They would rather cut the trees and/or go to court to fight cases against cutting. There are companies that are clear cutting the Sierras now.

12. Secretary Watts' Report:

Secretary Watts has resigned.

13. Treasurer Chasey's Report:

Treasurer Chasey reported all bills are paid and up to date.

14. Report: Maintenance of GMAC Website:

Webmaster Chasey reported the site is up to date.

15. Broadband Report: None

16. GMAC Promotion, Citizen Participation & Recruitment:

Council Chair Juengling said GMAC need three Regular Members and one Alternate Member. New

people who have bought businesses and moved to the community should be encouraged to become members.

17. Administrative Secretary Mobert's Report:

Administrative Secretary Mobert reported working 11.4 hours; materials were \$2.52, for a total of \$173.52.

18. Walk/See: CDP 2017-0047 (Koogle); Location: 29151 Walker Gulch Road; APN 142-010-30: **Council Members Chasey and Ivor** will lead the project.

19. Agenda for next meeting – 4 April 2019:

- a. **CDP #2017-0047 (Koogle);** Location: 29151 Walker Gulch Road; APN 142-010-30
- b. **Gualala Streetscaping Project Update and Report**
- c. **Cell Tower Forum**

20. Adjournment:

It was mutually agreed the meeting be adjourned at 21:26.

DRAFT Minutes prepared by Administrative Secretary Mobert

GMAC's archives may be viewed at this website: www.qualalamac.org, and/or by contacting Administrator Mobert: (707)884-3368.

The Mendocino County Board of Supervisors established the Gualala Municipal Advisory Council (GMAC) to advise them on planning issues that affect or have the potential to affect the Gualala area. The GMAC's role is advisory only.

Public Attendance and Participation is Encouraged at GMAC Meetings.